

## Authors

Bruno Crépon  
Centre de Recherche en Economie et Statistique (CREST)

Patrick Premand  
World Bank

# Creating New Positions? Direct and Indirect Effects of a Subsidized Apprenticeship Program\*

Bruno Crépon (Crest)  
Patrick Premand (World Bank and ETH Zürich)

October 11, 2018

## Abstract

Evaluations of employment programs usually focus on direct impacts on participants, but potential indirect effects are rarely quantified. This paper analyzes the impact of a subsidized apprenticeship program in Côte d'Ivoire. The experiment simultaneously randomized whether apprenticeship positions opened by firms were filled by the program, and whether interested youths were assigned to a formal apprenticeship. This design allows for estimating whether individuals forgo other apprenticeship opportunities (windfall effects), and whether firms replace other apprentices with program participants (substitution effects). We find both effects to be moderate. A framework shows how they combine: overall, 0.74 to 0.77 apprenticeship position is created per subsidized apprentice. Short term impacts on youth earnings were not significant. However, the net value of work provided by apprentices in firms increased, pointing to large indirect effects of the program.

*JEL classification:* D22, J23, J24, O12, C93

*Keywords:* Employment, Apprenticeship, Wage Subsidy, Training, Direct and Indirect Effects, Equilibrium Effects, Micro and Small Enterprises, Field experiment, Africa.

\*This paper is the result of a collaboration with the government of Côte d'Ivoire. We are particularly thankful to Adama Bamba, Bernard Toudy, Issaël Abdou Barry and Ousé Gueugot Toussaint at DCFE; Thérèse Bannoud and Ousmane Abdou Koffi at AGERFOP; as well as Raymond Wadoud Abdel Kamil at the World Bank. Funding from the Skills, DEHE (2) and John Gubertin Trust Funds at the World Bank are gratefully acknowledged. We thank Soule Elie Samadina for outstanding field coordination throughout the study, Joffé Brousselle for excellent baseline survey coordination, as well as Nando Tossouli, Hénriette Brousselle and Dinaouche Ali for leading follow-up data collection. Marina Tolchinsky, Matthew Olicks and Fatima Guedes provided excellent contributions to data analysis. Johannes Buba, Dora Filmer, Leonardo Lucarelli and unnamed participants in Cairo, ETH Zürich, Mannheim, Oxford and the World Bank provided useful comments and suggestions. All errors and omissions are our own. The findings, interpretations, and conclusions of the paper are those of the authors and do not necessarily represent the views of the World Bank or the government of Côte d'Ivoire.

# Creating New Positions? Direct and Indirect Effects of a Subsidized Apprenticeship Program

Evaluations of employment programs usually focus on direct impacts on participants, but potential indirect effects are rarely quantified. This paper analyzes the impact of a subsidized apprenticeship program in Côte d'Ivoire. The experiment simultaneously randomized whether apprenticeship positions opened by firms were filled by the program, and whether interested youths were assigned to a formal apprenticeship. This design allows for estimating whether individuals forgo other apprenticeship opportunities (windfall effects), and whether firms replace other apprentices with program participants (substitution effects). We find both

effects to be moderate. A framework shows how they combine: overall, 0.74 to 0.77 apprenticeship position is created per subsidized apprentice. Short term impacts on youth earnings were not significant. However, the net value of work provided by apprentices in firms increased, pointing to large indirect effects of the program.

October 11, 2018