

Authors

Isaac Mbiti
University of Virginia

Karthik Muralidharan
University of California, San Diego

Inputs, Incentives, and Complementarities in Education: Experimental Evidence from Tanzania*

Isaac Mbiti¹ Karthik Muralidharan¹ Mauricio Romero⁵ Youdi Schipper⁴
Constantine Manda³ Rakesh Rajani^{2*}

July 21, 2018

Abstract

The idea that complementarities across policies can yield increasing returns from joint implementation has been posited in several economic settings. Yet there is limited, well-identified evidence of such complementarities in practice. We present results from a randomized experiment across a representative sample of 350 schools in Tanzania that studied the impact of providing schools with (a) unconditional school grants, (b) bonus payments to teachers based on student performance, and (c) both of the above. At the end of two years, we find (a) no impact on student test scores from providing school grants, (b) some evidence of positive effects from offering performance-linked bonuses to teachers, and (c) significant positive effects on learning from providing both programs. Most importantly, we find strong evidence of complementarities between the two programs, with the effect of joint provision being significantly greater than the sum of the individual effects. Our results suggest that accounting for complementarities between inputs and incentives could substantially improve the effectiveness of public spending on education.

JEL Classification: C93, H52, I21, M52, O15

Keywords: school grants, teacher performance pay, complementarities, education policy, Tanzania

*We are grateful to Joseph Mbandao who superbly oversaw the implementation team. We thank Oriana Bandiera, Prashant Bharadwaj, Julie Cullen, Gordon Dahl, Taryn Donkeman, Eric Edmonds, Caroline Hoxby, David Figlio, Kelsey Jack, Kirabo Jackson, Jason Kerwin, Prashant Loyalka, Craig McIntosh, Adam Osman, Ineran Rauli, Mark Rosenzweig, Abhishek Singh, Tareket Suri, Rebecca Thornton and several seminar participants for comments. In addition, we would like to acknowledge the support of Bryan Plummer and J-PAL Africa staff: Erin Litwin, Jessica Mahoney, Kristi Post, and Rachel Steinacher provided excellent on-the-ground research support through Innovations for Poverty Action. We also thank Ian McDonough for additional research support. The data collection was conducted by the EDH Tanzania team including Resiphius Miti, Andreas Kufka, Timo Kymoy, Phil Barisio, Amy Kahn and Lindsay Root, and we are grateful to them for their excellent data collection efforts. We received IRB approval from Innovations for Poverty Action, Southern Methodist University, UC San Diego, and University of Virginia. The protocol was also reviewed and approved by the Tanzania Commission for Science and Technology (CONTECH). A randomized controlled trials registry entry and the pre-analysis plan are available at: <https://www.aocrsciregistry.org/trials/291>.

¹University of Virginia; J-PAL; IZA: imbiti@virginia.edu

²University of California, San Diego NBER; J-PAL: kmurali@ucsd.edu

³University of California, San Diego: mromero@ucsd.edu

⁴Insarova: yschipper@insarova.org

⁵Yale University: constantine.manda@yale.edu

^{*}Insarova: rakeshrajani@gmail.com

Inputs, Incentives, and Complementarities in Education: Experimental Evidence from Tanzania

We present results from a large-scale randomized experiment across 350 schools in Tanzania that studied the impact of providing schools with (a) unconditional grants, (b) teacher incentives based on student performance, and (c) both of the above. After two years, we find (a) no impact on student test scores from providing school grants, (b) some evidence of positive effects from teacher incentives, and (c) significant positive effects from providing both programs. Most importantly, we find strong evidence of complementarities between the two programs, with the effect of joint provision being significantly greater than the sum of the

individual effects. Our results suggest that combining spending on school inputs (which is the default policy) with improved teacher incentives could substantially increase the cost-effectiveness of public spending on education.

July 21, 2018