

Authors

Sule Alan
European University Institute

Dean Karlan
Northwestern University

Jonathan Zinman
Dartmouth College

Mehmet Cemalcilar
Yapi Kredi Bank

**Unshrouding Effects on Demand for a Costly Add-on:
Evidence from Bank Overdrafts in Turkey**

Sule Alan, Mehmet Cemalcilar, Dean Karlan, and Jonathan Zinman¹

January 2016

Abstract

The pricing and advertising of tied add-ons and overages have come under increasing scrutiny. Working with a large Turkish bank to test SMS direct marketing promotions to 108,000 existing holders of “free” checking accounts, we find that promoting a large discount on the 60% APR charged for overdrafts *reduces* overdraft usage. In contrast, messages mentioning overdraft availability without mentioning price *increase* usage. Neither change persists long after messages stop, suggesting that induced overdrafting is not habit-forming. We discuss implications for interventions to promote transparency in pricing and advertising, and for models of shrouded equilibria, limited attention, and salience.

Other keywords: contingent charges, deceptive advertising, transaction-linked credit, small-dollar loans, consumer banking, retail banking, deposit accounts

JEL codes: D12, D14, G2

¹ Contact information: Sule Alan: salan@eui.eu, University of Essex; Mehmet Cemalcilar: mehmet.cemalcilar@yapikredi.com.tr, Yapi Kredi Bank; Dean Karlan: dean.karlan@yale.edu, Yale University, IFA, J-PAL, and NBER; Jonathan Zinman: jzinman@dartmouth.edu, Dartmouth College, IFA, J-PAL, and NBER. We thank Yapi Kredi staff for their cooperation; Michael Grubb, Ben Keys, David Laibson, Eva Nagypal, Josh Schwartzstein, Andrei Shleifer, and audiences at Bowdoin College, Harvard/MIT, Kellogg (Finance), LSE, UCL, University of Maryland, University of Virginia, the Federal Reserve Bank of Philadelphia, the CFPB Research Conference, and the NBER Law & Economics group for comments; and Benoit Savio, Glynn Stutz, and Zachary Goff for research management and analysis support.

Unshrouding Effects on Demand for a Costly Add-on: Evidence from Bank Overdrafts in Turkey

The pricing and advertising of tied add-ons and overages have come under increasing scrutiny. Working with a large Turkish bank to test SMS direct marketing promotions to 108,000 existing holders of “free” checking accounts, we find that promoting a large discount on the 60% APR charged for overdrafts reduces overdraft usage. In contrast, messages

mentioning overdraft availability without mentioning price increase usage. Neither change persists long after messages stop, suggesting that induced overdrafting is not habit-forming. We discuss implications for interventions to promote transparency in pricing and advertising, and for models of shrouded equilibria, limited attention, and salience.

January 20, 2016